

Urinary Ethics in the Perspective of Hadith (Analysis of the Contradictions of the Prophet's Hadith)

Purwantoro

Sekolah Tinggi Agama
Islam At-Tahdzib Jombang,
Indonesia
email:
purwantoro789@gmail.com

Abstract

Background. *The ethics of defecating in Islam are not only related to physical cleanliness, but also include the spiritual and social dimensions of Muslims. The hadiths of the Prophet Muhammad SAW provide clear guidance on the procedures and manners of defecating, which aim to maintain cleanliness, health, and social harmony. Although textually we often encounter contradictions between hadiths mukhtalif the ethics of defecating.*

Aim. *This article aims to analyze the ethics of defecating taught in the hadith, especially hadiths that textually appear to be mukhtalif. The author analyzes the main principles contained therein, and explores the relevance of these teachings in modern life.*

Methods. *With a textual and kontekstual analysis approach to relevant hadiths. This article will reveal how important it is to interpret hadith contextually, and how to understand the mukhtalif hadiths.*

Results. *The hadith of the Prophet Muhammad SAW shows the Islamic religion's concern for cleanliness, politeness, and respect for certain places. After conducting in-depth research, it was found that there were no contradictions between the hadiths were found.*

Keywords: *Ethics, Urination, Hadith, Hygiene, Manners, Islam*

INTRODUCTION

In Islamic teachings, cleanliness is considered an integral part of holiness, which is not only related to physical cleanliness, but also includes spiritual aspects. The concept of cleanliness in Islam is often seen as a reflection of piety and devotion to Allah SWT. One aspect of cleanliness that is highly considered in Islam is the etiquette of defecating. Although defecating and urinating are activities carried out by every individual, Islam provides very detailed instructions on the correct way to perform these actions in accordance with the norms and ethics taught by the Prophet Muhammad SAW.

The toilet etiquette stated in the hadith emphasizes the importance of cleanliness and manners in everyday life. The Prophet's hadith not only provide guidance on how to maintain body cleanliness after defecating, but also on how to maintain the sanctity of the surrounding environment. It started when seeing contradictory Hadiths, especially in the ethics of defecating and the lack of studies on the ethics of defecating based on Hadith. This article will examine contradictory Hadiths concerning the ethics of defecating. In the book *Ta'wil Mukhtalif al-Hadiths* by Imam Ibn Qutaibah, several Hadiths are found relating to the ethics of defecating. First, it is stated that the Messenger of Allah never defecated standing up, contrary to the hadith which explains that the Messenger of Allah once urinated standing up. Second, it is stated that the Messenger of Allah forbade defecating facing the direction of the Qibla, contrary to the Prophet's hadith allowing defecation facing the Qibla.

This study aims to understand the Hadiths, explore the principles contained in the teachings, and examine their relevance in contemporary life. Through this study, it is hoped that a deeper



understanding of Islamic teachings related to cleanliness and toilet etiquette can be obtained so that they remain relevant and can be applied in modern life.

RESEARCH METHOD

This research article uses a library research method, namely a method of collecting data by understanding and studying theories from various literatures related to the research. The analysis method uses content analysis and descriptive analysis. Library materials obtained from various references are analyzed critically and in depth in order to support propositions and ideas. Before understanding the hadiths, the author will first conduct sanad research so that the quality of the hadith to be understood will be seen. After conducting research on the quality of the hadith, then the hadith will be understood. By using several methods of resolution in understanding the *mukhtalif hadiths*.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Toilet Etiquette in the Perspective of Hadith

Islam as a religion that regulates almost all aspects of human life pays great attention to cleanliness, including toilet etiquette. There are several main principles that can be found in the hadith related to toilet etiquette, which include personal hygiene, position or attitude when defecating, and the direction of facing when defecating.

Maintaining Cleanliness After Defecating

Hadith related to the manner of defecating emphasize the importance of cleanliness after the activity. For example, in a hadith narrated by Anas ibn Malik,

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو الْوَلِيدِ هِشَامُ بْنُ عَبْدِ الْمَلِكِ¹ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا شُعْبَةُ² عَنْ أَبِي مُعَاذٍ وَأَسْمُ عَطَاءِ بْنِ أَبِي مَيْمُونَةَ³ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ أَنَسَ بْنَ مَالِكٍ⁴ يَقُولُ كَانَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ إِذَا خَرَجَ لِحَاجَتِهِ أَجِيءُ أَنَا وَغُلَامٌ مَعَنَا إِدَاوَةٌ مِنْ مَاءٍ يَعْني يَسْتَنْجِي بِهِ⁵

"Has told us Abu Al Walid Hisham bin 'Abdul Malik said, has told us Syu'bah from Abu Mu'adz and his name is 'Atha bin Abu Maimunah he said, "I heard Anas bin Malik say, "If the Prophet sallallaahu 'alaihi wasallam went out to relieve himself, so I and a friend of mine brought a vessel filled with water, so that he could clean with it."

This hadith emphasizes the obligation to clean oneself after defecating with water, which not only functions to maintain physical cleanliness, but also symbolizes personal purity, so that a person can carry out worship in a clean state. Apart from the use of water, the hadith also records the use of stones as an alternative cleaner when water is not available. In the hadith narrated by Abu Hurairah, Rasulullah SAW said:

حَدَّثَنَا أَحْمَدُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ الْمَكِّيُّ⁶ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا عَمْرُو بْنُ يَحْيَى بْنِ سَعِيدِ بْنِ عَمْرٍو الْمَكِّيُّ⁷ عَنْ جَدِّهِ⁸ عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ⁹ قَالَ اتَّبَعْتُ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَخَرَجَ لِحَاجَتِهِ فَكَانَ لَا يَلْتَفِتُ فَدَنَوْتُ مِنْهُ فَقَالَ ابْغِنِي

¹ Hisham ibn Malik, he lived in Basrah, died in 227 H. According to Ibn Hajar he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

² Syu'bah bin Al Hajjaj bin Al Warad, he lived in Basrah, died in 160 H. According to Ibn Hajar, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

³ Atha' bin Abi Maymaunah Munai', he lived in Basrah, died in 131 H. According to an-Nasa'i, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

⁴ Anas bin Malik bin An Nadlir bin Dlamdlom bin Zaid bin Haram, he lived in Basrah, died in 91 H. He was a Companion of the Prophet.

⁵ Al-Imam Abu Abdillah Muhammad ibn Isma'il al-Bukhari, Sahih al-Bukhari, Beirut : Dar Ibnu Katsir, 1423 AH, Juz.

⁶ Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Al Walid bin 'Uqbah Al Azraq bin 'Amru, he lived in Ma'rur Rawd, died in 222 H. According to Ibn Hajar, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

⁷ Amru bin Yahya bin Sa'id bin 'Amru bin Sa'id bin Al 'Ash, he lived in Ma'rur Rawd. According to Ibn Hajar, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

⁸ Sa'id bin 'Amru bin Sa'id bin Al 'Ash, he lives in Kufa. According to Ibnu Hajar, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

أَحْبَارًا أَسْتَنْفِضُ بِهَا أَوْ نَحْوَهُ وَلَا تَأْتِنِي بَعْظُمٌ وَلَا رَوْثٌ فَأَتَيْتُهُ بِأَحْبَارٍ بِطَرَفِ ثِيَابِي فَوَضَعْتُهَا إِلَى جَنْبِهِ وَأَعْرَضْتُ عَنْهُ فَلَمَّا قَضَى أَتْبَعَهُ بِهِنَّ.¹⁰

"Has told us Ahmad bin Muhammad Al Makki said, has told us 'Amru bin Yahya bin Sa'id bin 'Amru Al Makki from his grandfather from Abu Hurairah he said, "I followed the Prophet sallallahu 'alaihi wasallam when he went out to relieve himself, and he did not look (to the right or to the left) until I approached him. Then he said: "Find me a stone to use for the ritual and don't bring bones or animal dung." carrying pebbles at the end of my cloth, I placed the rocks on his side, then I turned away from him. After he finished using the rocks."

This hadith reflects the flexibility of Islamic teachings, which adapt to local conditions. During the time of the Prophet SAW, when water was difficult to reach, stones were used as a means of cleaning. This shows that Islam does not bind its people to a particular method, but rather emphasizes the main goal of maintaining cleanliness. Some hadith emphasize the use of water as the main way to clean oneself after defecating, while others allow the use of stones. In this case, scholars state that both are valid, and there is no conflict, because it is adjusted to the conditions of the time and place. The use of stones is only recommended when water is not available. In today's era, with easier access to clean water, cleaning with water is more recommended.

Recommended Urination Positions

In Islamic teachings, every aspect of life is governed by the principles of cleanliness, politeness, and honor, including seemingly simple things like urinating. The position when urinating apparently gets special attention in the hadith of the Prophet Muhammad SAW. There are contradictory hadiths that explain how the Prophet urinated

Hadith: the Prophet urinating without standing up.

It is narrated through the Hadith from Aisyah that it is explained that:

حَدَّثَنَا وَكِيعٌ¹¹ عَنْ سُفْيَانَ¹² عَنِ الْمُقْدَامِ¹³ عَنْ أَبِيهِ¹⁴ عَنْ عَائِشَةَ قَالَتْ مَنْ حَدَّثَكَ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ بَالَ قَائِمًا فَلَا تُصَدِّقْهُ مَا بَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ قَائِمًا مُنْذُ أَنْزَلَ عَلَيْهِ الْقُرْآنَ.¹⁵

"Has told us Waqi' from Sufyan from Miqdam bin Syuraih bin Hani from his father, said Aisyah; "Whoever tells you that Rasulullah shallallahu 'alaihi wa sallam urinated standing up, do not believe him. Rasulullah shallallahu 'alaihi wa sallam never urinated standing up since the Qur'an was revealed to him"

This hadith explains that the Messenger of Allah was never standing when urinating. One of the important things emphasized in the hadith is not to urinate in a standing position. This is related to cleanliness and keeping dirt or impurities from spreading to the body or clothing. This hadith directs Muslims to avoid standing when urinating, because this position risks causing impurities to get on the body or clothing, which is certainly contrary to Islamic teachings on cleanliness.

Hadith: The Prophet urinated standing up

Regarding another hadith which explains that the Prophet SAW once urinated while standing, namely:

⁹ Abdur Rahman bin Shakhr, he lived in Medina, died in 57 H. He was a Companion of the Prophet.

¹⁰ Al-Imam Abu Abdillah Muhammad ibn Isma'il al-Bukhari, Sahih al-Bukhari, Beirut : Dar Ibnu Katsir, 1423 AH, Juz. 1 Pg. 42.

¹¹ Waki' bin Al Jarrah bin Malih, he lived in Kufah, died in 196 H. According to Ibnu Hajar, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

¹² Sufyan bin Sa'id bin Masruq, he lived in Kufah, died in 161 H. According to Ibnu Hajar, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

¹³ Al-Miqdam bin Syuraih bin Hani', he lives in Kufa. According to An-Nasa'i, he is a *tsiqah* narrator.

¹⁴ Syuraih bin Hani' bin Yazid bin Nahik, he lived in Kufah, died in 78 H. According to An-Nasa'i, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

¹⁵ Ahmad ibn Hanbal, *Musnad Al-Imam Ibnu Hanbal*, Muassalah al-Risalah, 1420H, Juz. 41, Pg. 495

حَدَّثَنَا آدَمٌ¹⁶ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا شُعْبَةُ¹⁷ عَنْ الْأَعْمَشِ¹⁸ عَنْ أَبِي وَائِلٍ¹⁹ عَنْ حُدَيْفَةَ²⁰ قَالَ أَتَى النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ سُبَّاطَةَ قَوْمٍ فَبَالَ قَائِمًا ثُمَّ دَعَا بِمَاءٍ فَجَنَّهُ بِمَاءٍ فَتَوَضَّأَ بِأَبِ الْبُولِ عِنْدَ صَاحِبِهِ وَالتَّسْتُرِ بِالْحَائِطِ²¹

"Adam has told us the Syu'bah from Al A'masy from Abu Wa'il from Hudzaifah said, "The Prophet sallallaahu 'alaihi wasallam came to a people's rubbish dump, he then urinated while standing. Then he asked water, so I came with water, then he performed ablution."

Textually, the two hadiths appear contradictory. The first hadith explains that the Messenger of Allah never urinated standing up since the time of prophethood. While the second hadith explains that the Messenger of Allah once urinated standing up. It should be understood that the second hadith explains that the Messenger of Allah urinated because he was in a place and condition that did not allow it.

Benefits of recommending urinating without standing up

There are several reasons why the sitting position when urinating is more recommended in Islam: 1) Maintaining Cleanliness; Cleanliness is a primary principle in Islam, including in terms of keeping the body from impurity. The sitting position allows for a more controlled flow of urine, making it easier to maintain the cleanliness of the body and clothes after urinating. 2) Avoiding Impurity on Clothes; If urinating while standing, the urine risks getting on the body or clothes, which can cause impurity. The sitting position helps to avoid the uncontrolled spread of urine, so that clothes remain clean and free from impurity. 3) Manners and Politeness; Islam places great emphasis on the importance of manners and politeness in every aspect of life, including urinating. Urinating while sitting is considered more polite, especially in public places or when there are other people around. This position also reflects a concern for honor and privacy. 4) Better Urine Control; With a sitting position, a person can more easily control the flow of urine, which allows the urination process to be more efficient and clean. This reduces the possibility of urine getting on parts of the body that it should not get on.

Some studies suggest that standing up to urinate may help men empty their bladders more completely. Sitting reduces pressure on the prostate and allows urine to flow more freely. This can potentially prevent or reduce prostate-related symptoms, such as difficulty urinating or decreased urinary tract function in older men. Although not recommended, there are times when standing up to urinate may be acceptable, such as in an emergency or when sitting is not available. In these circumstances, standing up to urinate may be more practical or quicker, especially when outdoors or in places where there are no toilet seats. However, it is better to find a more comfortable and safe place to urinate if possible.

Direction when defecating

Prohibition of facing towards the Qibla.

حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ²² قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا سُفْيَانُ²³ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا الزُّهْرِيُّ²⁴ عَنْ عَطَاءِ بْنِ يَزِيدَ اللَّيْثِيِّ²⁵ عَنْ أَبِي أَيُّوبَ الْأَنْصَارِيِّ²⁶ أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ إِذَا أَنْتَبْتُمُ الْعَائِطَ فَلَا تَسْتَقْبِلُوا الْقِبْلَةَ وَلَا تَسْتَدْبِرُوهَا

¹⁶ Adam bin Abu Iyas, he lived in Baghdad, died in 220 H. According to Ibnu Hajar, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

¹⁷ Syu'bah bin Al Hajjaj bin Al Warad, he lived in Basrah, died in 160 H. According to Ibn Sa'ad, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

¹⁸ Sulaiman bin Mihran, he lived in Kufah, died in 147 H. According to an-Nasa'i, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

¹⁹ Syaqiq bin Salamah, he lived in Kufah, died in 82 H. According to Ibnu Hajar, he was a reliable narrator.

²⁰ Hudzaifah bin Al Yaman, he was a Companion of the Prophet who died in 36 H.

²¹ Al-Imam Abu Abdillah Muhammad ibn Isma'il al-Bukhari, *Shahih al-Bukhari*, Beirut : Dar Ibnu Katsir, 1423 H, Juz. 1 Pg. 66

²² Ali bin 'Abdullah bin Ja'far bin Najih, he lived in Basrah, died in 234 H. According to Ibnu Hajar, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

وَلَكِنْ شَرَّفُوا أَوْ عَرَّبُوا قَالَ أَبُو أَيُّوبَ فَقَدِمْنَا الشَّامَ فَوَجَدْنَا مَرَايِضَ يُنَبِّتُ قِبَلَ الْقِبْلَةِ فَنَنْحَرِفُ وَنَسْتَعْفِرُ اللَّهَ تَعَالَى وَعَنْ الزُّهْرِيِّ عَنْ عَطَاءٍ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ أَبَا أَيُّوبَ عَنِ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ مِثْلَهُ²⁷.

"Has told us 'Ali bin 'Abdullah said, has told us Sufyan said, has told us Az Zuhri from 'Atha' bin Yazid Al Laiti from Abu Ayyub Al Ansari, that the Prophet sallallaahu 'alaihi wasallam said: "If you come to When you enter the toilet, do not face the direction of the Qibla or turn your back to it, but face it to the east or to the west." Abu Ayyub said, "When we came to Syria, we found that the toilets in the houses there were built facing the Qibla. So we diverted them and we asked forgiveness from Allah Ta'ala." And from Az Zuhri from 'Atha said, I heard Abu Ayyub from the Prophet sallallaahu 'alaihi wasallam like this."

The Prophet ordered to change the direction of defecation

حَدَّثَنَا بِهِ²⁸ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا حَمَادُ بْنُ سَلَمَةَ²⁹ حَدَّثَنَا خَالِدُ الْحَدَّاءُ³⁰ عَنْ خَالِدِ بْنِ أَبِي الصَّلْتِ³¹ قَالَ ذَكَرُوا عِنْدَ عُمَرَ بْنِ عَبْدِ الْعَزِيزِ رَحِمَهُ اللَّهُ اسْتِقْبَالَ الْقِبْلَةِ بِالْفُرُوجِ فَقَالَ عِرَاكُ بْنُ مَالِكٍ³² قَالَتْ عَائِشَةُ ذَكَرُوا عِنْدَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ أَنَّ قَوْمًا يَكْرَهُونَ ذَلِكَ قَالَ فَقَالُوا فَعَلَوْهَا حَوْلَهَا مَقْعَدَتِي نَحْوَ الْقِبْلَةِ³³.

"It has been told to us that Bahzun said; has told us Hammad bin Salamah has told us Khalid Al Hadza` from Khalid bin Abi Ashshalt said; "They told Umar bin Abdul Aziz (may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him) about facing the Qibla with one's private parts. 'Irak bin Malik said; Aisyah said; "They have told Rasulullah SAW that there is a people who are not happy with that." he said; he said: " They have done it, so change my seat (WC) to face the Qibla."

In understanding the two hadiths, the first is that the second hadith is a weak hadith because there are narrators who are *majhul*. Therefore, in this case it can be understood that there is a recommendation to defecate not facing the direction of the qibla, guided by the understanding of the hadith narrated by Abu Ayyub al-Anshari. That the Messenger of Allah ordered not to face or turn away from the direction of the qibla when defecating.

CONCLUSION

The ethics of defecating in the perspective of the Prophet' hadith show that Islam pays attention to cleanliness, politeness, and respect for certain places. However, there are several potential contradictions in several hadiths that must be analyzed more deeply, both in terms of context, meaning, and application in modern life. After conducting in-depth research, it was found that there were no contradictions between contradictory hadiths. It is important for Muslims to take the right approach in understanding these hadiths, by considering contextual aspects, relevance of the times, and the overall objectives of the *sharia*. In this way, Muslims can maintain cleanliness and manners in everyday life, without getting caught up in contradictions of understanding that can hinder the optimal practice of Islamic teachings. The author feels that this article is far from perfect due to the lack of in-

²³ Sufyan bin 'Uyainah bin Abi 'Imran Maimun, he lived in Kufa, died in 198 AH. According to Adz-Dzahabi, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

²⁴ Muhammad bin Muslim bin 'Ubaidillah bin 'Abdullah bin Shihab, he lived in Medina, died in 124 H. According to Ibn Hajar, he was a faqih and hafidz narrator.

²⁵ Atha' bin Yazid, he lived in Medina, he died in 107 H. According to al-Nasa'i, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

²⁶ Khalid bin Zaid bin Kulaib, whose nickname was Abu Ayyub, he lived in Medina, died in 50 H. He was a Companion of the Prophet.

²⁷ Al-Imam Abu Abdillah Muhammad ibn Isma'il al-Bukhari, *Shahih al-Bukhari*, Beirut : Dar Ibnu Katsir, 1423 H, Juz. 1 Pg. 109.

²⁸ Bahza bin Asad, he lived in Basrah, died in 197 AH. According to an-Nasa'i, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

²⁹ Hammad bin Salamah bin Dinar, he lived in Basrah, he died in 167 H. According to an-Nasa'i, he was a *tsiqah* narrator.

³⁰ Khalid bin Mihran, he lived in Basrah, he died in 141 H. According to an-Nas'i, he was a *tsiqah* narrator..

³¹ Khalid bin Abi Ash Shalt, he lives in Basrah. Ibn Hazm is a unknown narrator.

³² Iraq bin Malik, he lives in Medina. According to Ibn Hajar, he is a *tsiqah* narrator.

³³ Ahmad ibn Hanbal, *Musnad Al-Imam Ibnu Hanbal*, Muassalah al-Risalah, 1420H, Juz. 43, Pg. 31

depth study of medical findings on the benefits of defecation ethics in the Hadith. This study recommends further research on contradictory hadiths so that Islamic teachings can be in harmony and in line.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- al-Adabi, Salahuddin ibn Ahmad, *Metodologi Kritik Matan Hadits*, Terj. Qadirun Nur dan Ahmad Musyafiq, Jakarta: Gaya Media Pratama, 2004.
- al-'Aini, Badr al-Din Abi Muhammad Mahmud ibn Ahmad, *'Umdah al-Qari, Syarhu Shahih al-Bukhari*, Beirut: Muhammad Amin Damj, t.th.
- al-'Asqalani, Syihab al-Din Ahmad ibn Ali ibn Hajar, *Fath al-Bari Syarh Sahih al-Bukhari*, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1421H.
- _____, *Tahdzib al-Tahdzib*, n.plc: Dar al-Fikr, 1415H.
- al-Bukhari, Muhammad bin Ismail, *Shahih al-Bukhari*, Beirut: Dar Ibn Katsir, 1407H.
- al-Hajjaj, Abu al-Husain Muslim bin, *Sahih Muslim* (n.plc.: Dar al-Fikr al-Dauliyyah, 1319H.
- Al-Maza, al-Hafidz al-Muttaqin Jamal al-Din Abi al-Hajjaj Yusuf, *Tahdzib al-Kamal fi Asmai al-Rijal*, Beirut: Muassasah al-Risalah, 1405H.
- al-Syafi'i, Ahmad bin Ali bin Hajar Abu al-Fadl al-Asqalani, *Tahdzib al-Tahdzib*, Beirut: Darul Fikr, 1404 H.
- al-Tamimi, Abdurrahman bin Abi Hatim Muhammad bin Idris Abu Muhammad al-Razi, *Al-Jarh wa At-Ta'dil*.
- Goel, Apul, dkk, Evaluation of Impact of Voiding Posture on Uroflowmetry Parameters in Men. *World J Mens Health* 2017 August 35(2): 100-106
<https://doi.org/10.5534/wjmh.2017.35.2.100>
- Kousta, E., & Kirby, R. S. (2012). The effect of posture on voiding dynamics in men with lower urinary tract symptoms. *Journal of Urology*, 188(2), 612-617.
<https://journals.plos.org/plosone/article?id=10.1371/journal.pone.0101320>